Article

Exploring Translation Strategies of Japanese *Manga* in Google Translate and *Komikcast* Translations

Badriyah Yusof[1], Hassanal Basuni[2]

[1-2]*Universiti Brunei Darussalam, Bandar Seri Begawan, Brunei Darussalam*

ABSTRACT

This paper examines the translations of 'Golden Kamuy Vol. 1' from Japanese to Bahasa Melayu/Bahasa Indonesia by MT system Google Translate (GT) and online fan-based translating community *Komikcast*. Given the linguistic and sociocultural differences between the source language (SL) and target language (TL), translating *manga* demands expertise and a profound understanding of the cultural nuances embedded in the SL, the specific *manga* genre, and the target audience. This qualitative descriptive study uses Vinay and Darbelnet's (1958/1995) translation strategies to analyze the translations of 'Golden Kamuy Vol. 1' by GT and *Komikcast*. The study finds that both platforms employ Literal Translation, Borrowing, and Equivalence strategies, with *Komikcast* additionally using Modulation. GT primarily relies on literary translation, which is consistent with its algorithmic nature and reliance on translation memories. Conversely, *Komikcast* emphasizes the Equivalence strategy, recognizing the significance of language proficiency and the contextual and cultural insights human translators provide. Findings are discussed in relation to Nida's equivalence effects, particularly regarding the translated text's purpose, translators' knowledge, and cultural differences in SL and TL. This research enhances our understanding of manga translation, as well as the strengths and limitations of machine and human translation, while contributing to the broader discussion on translation studies. While acknowledging the role and potential of machine translation, this research also reinforces the critical role of human translators in bridging linguistic and cultural gaps between Japanese and Indonesian, highlighting the need for translators to possess deep cultural insights and proficiency beyond literal translations for more authentic and contextually accurate renditions.

I. INTRODUCTION

Translation, a multifaceted and essential process, involves the conversion of written or spoken content from one language into another. It is a bridge that connects diverse linguistic and cultural landscapes, enabling effective communication across the globe. In comic translation such as of *manga,* for instance, translating process goes beyond the mere conversion of textual content but involves tailoring the translation to suit a specific culture. *Manga*, an umbrella term referring to various types of comic books and graphic novels produced and published in Japan (Pagan, 2018) is not just a manifestation of Otaku culture but

also a celebrated form of Japanese culture that has traversed centuries. The origins of *manga* can be traced back to ancient Japanese scroll art, honed by Buddhist monks in the 12th century, notably exemplified by the *Chouju Giga* or 'Scrolls of Frolicking Animals.' This scroll artistry, credited to a monk named Bishop Toba, featured anthropomorphic animal characters, such as monkeys, rabbits, raccoons, and frogs, engaged in comical and expressive actions embedding themes of religious teachings, ghost stories, and a myriad of whimsical characters navigating peculiar events (Robin, 2007).

In the present *manga*, which can be humorous,

creative, inspirational, philosophical, or stylistic in nature, these themes range from romance, sports, domestic life, kitchen scenarios, office environments, cooking, to parliamentary matters. These narratives evoke a plethora of emotions and convey values and virtues, including *konjou* or strong determination, career pursuit, self-denial, dedication, resilience, valor, unrequited love, and much more (Hashimoto, 2023). Initially regarded as a medium of entertainment primarily for children, *manga* has evolved to hold profound significance and has become a subject of academic inquiry especially since its revolutionary phase in the 1950s with the broadcasting of Tezuka Osamu's Astro Boy (Tezuka Productions, 2023). In her article 'Pop Culture: Manga,' Akiko Hashimoto asserts that *manga* has attained a heightened social status despite its origins as children's entertainment. Today, *manga* serves as a legitimate literary resource for research and critique. With the rapid advancement of technology, *manga* is striding in the digital world. Masaaki Shimizu, a Square Enix's publishing team member, reported a 40% decrease in print publication (Ayyup, 2020).

Taking this background into consideration, comic translators, *manga* included, are not simply tasked with word-for-word translation but must also infuse creativity into their work to ensure that the intended information and effect resonates with readers (EVS: Global Translations and Business Services, 2012). Furthermore, translating comics from one language to another is tightly intertwined with the translation of visual culture (Zanettin, 2008). It encompasses the recontextualisation of the intricate cultural subtleties woven into comics. Translated comics often undergo adaptations to align with the specific demands and cultural contexts of the TL, prompting the emergence of 'transcreation,' signifying the translation of text while considering cultural norms, slang, vernacular language, colloquial expressions, and connotations rooted in the SL. The comic translation is a multifaceted endeavour fraught with challenges and intricacies. At its core, comics consist of three essential linguistic elements: dialogue, captions, and descriptive text. Translating comic dialogues requires a finesse akin to rendering natural conversations, like translating a screenplay or a novel. Captions, on the other hand, compose the formal narrative thread weaving through the comic's storyline. Meanwhile, incorporating descriptive language within comics demands

a heightened level of skill, emphasising the translator's pivotal role (Wabbit Translations, 2022). Successfully navigating these format-related challenges hinges significantly on the translator's expertise. Furthermore, the linguistic styles employed in comics introduce an additional layer of complexity to the translation process. Comics may occasionally feature specific dialects or even invent new slang terms, necessitating translators to harness their linguistic prowess to convey these distinct linguistic nuances in the target language or TL (Wabbit Translations, 2022). Tackling such innovative slang can prove daunting, as local equivalents may not readily exist, potentially leading to misunderstandings.

In addition to linguistic style and dialogue, translating onomatopoeic sounds, where actions or sounds are represented textually, presents a formidable challenge. Onomatopoeic expressions can vary significantly from one language to another. Historically, translators often preserve the original form when borrowing onomatopoeia from English due to a dearth of suitable local vocabulary (Wabbit Translations, 2022). These multifarious obstacles underscore the intricate artistry of comic translation, demanding translators to deftly navigate linguistic formats, styles, and unique textual representations. Another challenge in comic translation is Adaptation, particularly when translating materials for children. Adaptation involves modifying content to make it more suitable for the target audience, often in the context of children's literature (Vahhabzadeh, 2018). This entails altering messages and content to ensure age-appropriateness. To do so, translators must be well-acquainted with the intended audience for the translated material.

In this regard, Vinay and Darbelnet's (1995) translation strategies have long served as guiding principles in translation, offering a systematic framework for translators to navigate the complexities of transferring meaning and nuances between languages. This paper explores translation strategies within the context of Japanese *manga* comics being translated into Malay/Bahasa Indonesia, languages with distinct linguistic and sociocultural backgrounds. Successful *manga* translation demands not only linguistic expertise but also a deep understanding of the cultural intricacies, genre-specific nuances, and the target audience's preferences. It is within this intricate

tapestry that translation strategies play a pivotal role, facilitating the faithful transformation of source text (ST) into target text (TT).

In the same vein, a review of previous studies reveals a burgeoning interest in *manga* translation, exploring aspects ranging from linguistic strategies to cultural adaptations. In the last two decades, studies on *manga* have been conducted along the nexus of representations and genres (Berndt, 2016, 2018, 2020; Jaqueline & Kümmerling-Meibauer, 2013; Prough, 2010b, 2010a; Zanettin, 2019), history, religion and development (Berndt, 2014; Ito, 2005; MacWilliams, 2012; Williams, 2009), cultural product (P. Abdul Wahid, 2007; P. R. Abdul Wahid et al., 2019; Freedman, 2018; Freedman & Slade, 2018), as well as gender and sexualities (Chan, 2017; Darlington & Cooper, 2010; Lewicki, 2022; Ting, 2019), among numerous others. Within the realm of translation studies, research on *manga* translations and *scanlations* (Sell, 2011) ranges from issues surrounding localisations (Hevia, 2007; Maser, 2020; Schodt, 2016), adaptation (Zanettin, 2014, 2018), *danmaku subtitling* or online collaborative translation (Yang, 2021), automated or machine translations (Hinami et al., 2021; Sharif et al., 2021), use of notes in scanlations (Fabbretti, 2016; Okyayuz, 2017) and *manga* translations as a pedagogical tool (Furuhata-turner, 2013; Rohan et al., 2021). In the Malay/ Bahasa Indonesia-speaking region, studies on *manga* translation cover the translation of humour and onomatopoeia in *manga* (Chow & Che Omar, 2019), as well as aspects of translation procedures and intercultural communication (Chow & Omar, 2019; Ningsih & Hidayat, 2018; Salsabila & Laksman-Huntley, 2020). Yean Fun Chow, Haslina Haroon and Hasuria Che Omar works on translating *manga* in Malaysia, for instance, emphasise the use of multimodal elements such as notes (Chow et al., 2020), typography (Chow, 2023), and agencies (Chow & Omar, 2021) as means to aid translating strategies; and the role of external factors such as censorship (Chow et al., 2021), as well as policies, publishers and local market (Chow & Omar, 2019) in shaping the *mangascape* in Malaysia.

In the same spectrum, *manga* translation procedures involving automated or machine translators such as Google Translate and CAT tools such as online dictionaries are also discussed. In "Perbandingan terjemahan manusia dengan terjemahan mesin dalam buku Fitness 24/7," Nur

Faezah Mohd Ayob and Hasnah Mohamad (2015) adopted Nord's (2005) functional approach to analyze a translation of "Cergas 24/7" by Kevin Zahri using Google Translate and compared it with a human translation. The study found that there was a modest similarity of 31.6 per cent in the handling of technical texts between human and machine translations. This observation underscores the necessity for human intervention in machine translation to attain enhanced translation quality. It illustrates that while machine translation has made significant strides, it has yet to achieve the level of proficiency and comprehension exhibited by human translators.

Whereas, in a research conducted by Muhammad Nur Ramadhan (2019) on the translation of Wakamono Kotoba or 'slang of the young people' in the *manga* "One Piece" into Bahasa Indonesia, his study aimed to identify the translation strategies and techniques used based on Newmark's (1981) framework while also assessing the degree of equivalence achieved in the translations. Additionally, the researcher determined whether the translations were equivalent by comparing them to definitions in online dictionaries such as Zokugo-dict.com, Weblio.jp, Kenji Matsura's Japanese-Indonesian dictionary, and Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia. The research found that the most frequently used translation strategy was 'free translation', with the most common technique being Modulation, highlighting the challenges of achieving equivalence in translation.

A study conducted by Luh Gede Wika Elfayanti (2015) on the translation procedures in *manga* focuses on translation of Japanese idioms in Doraemon's Teema Betsu Kessaku Sen Edisi 1-17 comic using Baker (1992), and Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) translating strategies. By employing translation density techniques and specific selection techniques on 34 idioms, 28 idioms were paraphrased, five were translated directly, and one was left untranslated. The study also revealed that the translator used Literal Translation, Transposition, Adaptation, and Equivalence strategies to translate the idioms.

In a more recent study conducted by Febri Nur Dwiyanti, Hermandra, and Intan Suri (2022) titled "Penerjemahan Kanyouku dalam Novel Shikisai wo Motanai Tazaki Tsukuru to Kare no Junrei no Toshi Karya Haruki Murakami," the researchers used insights from Baker's (1992) idiom translation

strategies and Vinay & Darbelnet's (1995) translation procedures to describe the strategies and procedures for translating *Kanyouku* or idioms. Their data consisted of upper-body idioms extracted from Haruki Murakamis novel "Shikisai wo Motanai Tazaki Tsukuru to Kare no Junrei no Toshi," and its Indonesian translation Tsukuru Tazaki Tanpa Warna dan Tahun Ziarahnya," by Ribeka Ota in 2018. The study found that the translator employed various strategies such as Idiomatic Equivalence and Paraphrase and used procedures like Literal translation and Transposition to accurately convey the intended meaning of the idioms.

In "Transposition and Modulation occured in the Translation of Meitantei Conan *Manga* Volume 61," Yuniarsih, Eky Kusuma and Andra Roni (2022) investigate 'form shifts' and 'meaning shifts' in the 'Meitantei Conan' *manga* using Catford's (1965) 'translation shifts', Vinay and Darbelnet's (1995) 'meaning shifts', and Nida and Taber's (1969) translation processes. The 'Simak' approach (Mahsun, 2012) was used for data collection, and a comparative translation analysis method was employed for analysis. The findings revealed 44 'form shifts' and 'meaning shifts' were used as translating strategies. Additionally, five instances exhibited 'form shifts' and 'modulation' simultaneously. Most 'form shifts' fell into the category of 'unit shift', while most 'meaning shifts' fell into the 'reversal of terms'. This phenomenon occurred due to the cultural differences between the SL and TL. This review underscores a crucial aspect of translation, i.e. the impact of cultural divergence on the fidelity of the translated text.

Despite the voluminous studies conducted by previous scholars, a few research gaps still exist in the field of *manga* translation particularly within Japanese-Indonesia working pairs. This includes the use of multimodal elements, typography, and agencies in translation strategies, the role of censorship and policies in shaping the mangascape, and the degree of equivalence achieved in translations of culturally rich and context-specific language elements. Similarly, there is also a need for more research on the interplay between human and machine translations, particularly within the context of technical texts, to attain enhanced translation quality. The objective of this research, therefore, is twofold: firstly, to provide a comprehensive analysis of the translation strategies employed in *manga*, focusing on specific elements like

onomatopoeia and cultural idioms; and secondly, to assess the degree of equivalence achieved in these translations, considering both linguistic and cultural dimensions. By employing an analytical approach such as of Vinay and Darbelnet's translation strategies (1958/1995), this study aims to fill the existing gap in literature, offering insights that can guide future translation endeavors in the realm of *manga*. The expected outcomes of this research are manifold. Firstly, it will contribute to the existing body of knowledge on *manga* translation, offering a nuanced understanding of the strategies and challenges involved. Secondly, by highlighting the areas that require attention, such as the translation of cultural idioms or innovative slang, it will inform and guide translators, ensuring more accurate and culturally resonant translations. Ultimately, this research seeks to enrich our understanding of *manga* as a cultural artifact and underscore the indispensable role of translation in bridging linguistic and cultural divides.

II. METHODS

This qualitative descriptive study employs Vinay and Darbelnet's translation strategies (1958/1995) to compare translations produced by Google Translate and *Komikcast*. Insights from this comparison will shed light on the prominent strategies used and their meaning in terms of equivalence and equivalence effects. In their seminal work, Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/1995) outline seven translating strategies: Borrowing, Calque, Literal Translation, Transposition, Modulation, Equivalence, and Adaptation. These strategies can be further divided into direct and oblique, where the former aims to transfer SL's conceptual and structural elements into TL. In their framework, direct translation strategies include Borrowing, Calque, and Literal Translation, while Oblique translation strategies comprise Transposition, Modulation, Equivalence, and Adaptation. In Borrowing, a translator incorporates technical terms or concepts from the SL into the TL. Borrowing involves directly importing words from the SL due to a lack of corresponding vocabulary in the TL, or to expand the TL's lexicon. Typically, Borrowing retains the style of the ST while conveying significant meaning. In comparison, Calque is a translation technique where an expression or phrase from the ST is borrowed but translated literally, word for word. This approach can introduce new expressions while preserving

the sentence structure of the TL. Similarly, Literal Translation involves transferring the ST directly to the TT, word for word. This strategy translates each word from the SL and then adapts it to the TL.

Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/1995) contend that if translators cannot employ a literal or direct translation approach, they should resort to other translation strategies, such as Transposition, Modulation, Equivalence, and Adaptation. These oblique strategies allow translators to demonstrate their skill in freely translating text to achieve a high level of equivalence. Within this framework, Transposition refers to changing the word class from one part of speech to another without altering the meaning. There are two types of Transposition: obligatory and optional. Obligatory Transposition is used when there is a significant disparity in the language systems between the source and TTs. On the other, Modulation entails changes in semantics and the viewpoint from the SL to the TL. Modulation can be obligatory or optional and is typically used to convey meaning or understanding more naturally from the SL to the TL. Whereas Equivalence often involves modifying SL words to fit the TL. This strategy is frequently employed for foreign terms not present in the TL but with meanings closely resembling existing terms. Finally, Adaptation is a translation strategy used when there is no direct counterpart in the ST for a concept in the TT. In such cases, the translator must create a new concept in the TT that closely aligns with the ST's concept.

The selected data is a *manga* titled 'Golden Kamuy,' authored and illustrated by Satoru Noda. This *manga* comprises 187 pages and represents the first volume published on August 21, 2014. 'Golden Kamuy' was chosen due to its immense popularity, boasting approximately 23 million copies in circulation, making it one of the best-selling *manga* series. For practicality, this study will only look at Chapters 1 to 7 of this *manga*, as the data pertains to the same theme, specifically regarding the history of the Ainu people and their legacy. The "Golden Kamuy Vol.1" will be transcribed at the groundwork level using the MT system Google Translate. Translation will be conducted using sentence by sentence (within speech bubbles) to facilitate easy parsing and include onomatopoeic sounds. Similarly, translations from the fan-based page *Komikcast* will also be transcribed into a similar format for practical comparison. In the analysis, a translation strategy for each translated text/sentence will be identified. Findings will be tabulated and discussed using Nida's concept of equivalence and equivalence effect.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Findings have shown that Google Translate and *Komikcast* utilize four translating strategies in their translation output, namely Literal Translation, Equivalence, Borrowing, and Modulation. Table 1 demonstrates the tabulation of these strategies, with literal translation used mainly by both platforms, and modulation employed by *Komikcast* exclusively. For practical purposes, only the first two strategies will be discussed in this section.

Despite coinciding Vinay and Darbelnet's observation on literal translation "being most common between languages of the same family and culture" (1958/1995: 57), the reason for the predominant selection of this strategy is owed to its simplicity, consistency and laxity of context, as the language structures between Japanese and Malay are fundamentally different. The Japanese sentences comprised of Subject → Object → Verb structure, and Malay structure follows Subject → Verb → Object syntactic format (Yogyanti, 2022). Akin to other direct translating strategies such as Borrowing and Calque, Literal Translation requires minimal linguistic analysis leading to the production of basic, literal meaning in the ST. In Literal Translation, the strategy involves initially rendering the ST's word-for-word and subsequently tailoring it to the TL. In the dataset, this strategy is exemplified in the form of nouns such as 高地 *kōchi* or 'high ground' in (1), verbs アプック *yoba re* or 'to be called' in (2), as well as 盗った *totta* or 'stole' and 皆殺し *minagoroshi* or 'killed' in (3), and adjective 欲 *yoku* or 'cruelty' in (4), as illustrated below (Takoboto, 2023).

1. SL   明治三十年 二〇三高地
       Meiji san jū-nen ni rei san kōchi
       (*Eng.* Meiji 30, Highland 203)
   GT   Meiji 30, 203 **Tanah Tinggi**
       (*Eng.* Meiji 30, 203 Highlands)
           (Appendix A: 1)

2. SL 「不死身の杉元」って呼ばれてた んだって?

    `Fujimi no sugi moto' tte yoba re teta n datte?

    (*Eng.* I heard he was called "Immortal Sugimoto"?)

    GT Adakah dia **dipanggil** "Sugimoto Abadi"?

    (*Eng.* Is he called "Sugimoto Immortal"?)

    (Appendix A: 34)

3. SL それをひとりの男がブン盗った　持ってたアイヌを皆殺しにしてな

    Sore o hitori no otoko ga bun totta motteta Ainu o minagoroshi ni shite na

    (*Eng.* One man stole it and killed all the Ainu who owned it.)

    K Lalu, ada satu pria yang **mencuri** semuanya. Dan **membunuh seluruh** Ainu yang menjaganya

    (*Eng.* Then, there was one man who stole everything. And killed all the Ainu who guarded it)

    (Appendix A: 45)

4. SL しかしそれこそが　囚人たちにとっちゃ脱獄の好機だった　欲をかい た連中が　外に連れ出すことを囚人たちは　読んでいたのさ

    Shikashi sore koso ga shūjin-tachi ni totcha datsugoku no kōkidatta yoku o kaita renchū ga soto ni tsuredasu koto o shūjin-tachi wa yonde ita no sa

    (*Eng.* But that was a chance for the prisoners to escape, as they had read that greedy people would take them out.)

    K Tapi, itulah saat-saat yang ditunggu para tahanan. Mereka tahu kalau ada orang **tamak** yang akan mengeluarkan mereka.

    (*Eng.* But, those were the moments the prisoners had been waiting for. They know that there are greedy people who will take them out)

    (Appendix A: 64)

On the other hand, *Komikcast* utilises more Equivalence strategy in their translations compared to *GT*. The Equivalence strategy involves altering the words in the ST to make them suitable for the TL. This approach is used when different languages employ diverse structural or stylistic methods to describe the same situation. In (5), *GT* uses the addressing term *Encik* or Mr. as an equivalent to the morpheme −さん / *-san* to convey the meaning of politeness and respect embedded in the ST. Whereas, while 話す *hanasu* means 'talk or discussion' in the ST, *Komikcast* renders it as *rahasia* or ‹secret› in TT to fit the context where the discussion is secretive.

Equivalence and Equivalence Effects

5. SL 杉元佐一さん

    Sugimoto Saichi-san

    (*Eng.* Mr. Saichi Sugimoto)

    GT **Encik** Saichi Sugimoto

    (*Eng.* Mr. Saichi Sugimoto)

    (Appendix A: 16)

6. SL 砂金にまつわる話　なんだけどよ ひとに言っちゃ　だめだぜ　あんたの事気に入ったから話すんだぜ

    Sakin ni matsuwaru hanashina ndakedo yo hito ni itcha dameda ze anta no koto kiniittakara hanasu nda ze

    (*Eng.* It's a story about gold dust. Don't tell anyone. I'm telling you this because I like you.)

    GT Ini cerita soal tumpukan emas. Harusnya tak boleh aku ceritakan pada siapa-siapa. Tapi karena saya suka padamu, aku beri tahu sedikit **rahasia.**

    (*Eng.* This is a story about a pile of gold. I shouldn't have told anyone. But because I like you, I'll tell you a little secret.)

    (Appendix A: 42)

In line with this analysis, findings are discussed along the line of Nida's principle of equivalence and equivalence effects. In his framework, Nida (1958/1964) establishes formal equivalence, and dynamic equivalence. Formal equivalence focuses on the message, considering both form and meaning, necessitating close similarity between the ST and TT. Dynamic equivalence, on the other, is based on the principle of equivalent effect. This principle discusses the relationship between the ST and TT, with the ST having an equivalent effect to that in the TT. Nida also mentioned the concept of naturalness, referring to the primary goal of equivalence in producing

a text that is natural and nearly equivalent to the ST. The concept of naturalness is a core element in Nida's equivalence theory, relying on adjustments in grammar, cultural references, and lexicon from the ST. Nida posits that in translation, the content of the text takes precedence over its form. Along this nexus, proposed three factors suggesting the type of translation: 1) the meaning contained in the text, 2) the purpose of translating the text, and 3) the target audience. With these three factors, the relationship between meaning and style becomes apparent. If the ST prioritises style over meaning, the translator should employ formal equivalence in the translation. Conversely, if the opposite is true, dynamic equivalence is recommended.

In this vein, GT functions as a machine translation system utilising Neural Machine Translation or NMT technology and contributions from human translators through the translator community. Technically, NMT encompasses various translation engines employing neural networks to interpret sequences of numbers, much like decoding a numerical sequence. In the context of translation, this numerical sequence corresponds to a sentence in the SL subsequently translated into the TL. For basic text comprehension, such as inquiring about locations or general information, GT provides accurate translations and effectively fulfills its tasks especially when such translation command is already made available in the data system. However, a human translator becomes indispensable for more complex translations containing syntax, idiomatic expressions, and intricate content. Hence, an in-depth understanding of linguistic elements and cultural nuances will ensure that a TT closely approximates the ST (Sam Yip, n.d.). Compared to MT systems, which heavily rely on algorithms and mathematics rather than genuine comprehension of SL (Espresso Translations, 2023), human translation relies on translators' language proficiency and their knowledge of the TL, allowing them to exercise their translation pragmatically. The translator's competence, linguistic choices, and cultural sensitivity, collectively contribute to the achievement of text equivalence in translation. Translators play a pivotal role in balancing these factors to ensure that the translated text effectively conveys the intended meaning and resonates with the target audience while maintaining cultural and linguistic fidelity to the ST. This multifaceted approach to translation facilitates the seamless transfer of content, themes, and cultural nuances from the SL to the TL. Following this, differences in translation output between GT and *Komikcast* can be owed to three aspects that determine the level of equivalence effects: i/ the purpose of the translated text, ii/ knowledge of the translator, and, iii/ cultural differences in SL and TL.

Purpose of the Translated Text

Regarding the translator's purpose and the expectations of the target audience, *manga* 'Golden Kamuy' is read by individuals aged 20 to 60 among the younger population (LompatLompat, 2020). Therefore, the translator must have the skill to capture readers' attention within this age group. Translators should satisfy the expectations of the target audience by conveying the original meaning from the ST using clear and engaging sentence structures. One way to captivate the readers is by modifying the translation text using appropriate language styles such as onomatopoeia, metaphors, idiomatic expressions, among others, to create a more intuitive atmosphere. Where GT can fulfil these expectations within its scope of memory, it is limited to basic commands and less-nuanced expressions. This is exemplified in (7), where unlike GT, *Komikcast* offers a more explicit portrayal of the character's situation, specifically highlighting that one of the character's hands is broken, capturing the tense situation of the character and an elaborate description of the injury in the ST.

This discrepancy in translation approaches

7. ST　この状況で「不死身の杉元」は手に負えん 片腕だけに

(*Eng.* In this situation, the "immortal sugimoto" is uncontrollable, with only one arm.)

GT　Dalam situasi ini, "Sugimoto Abadi" tidak terurus, dengan hanya satu **lengan.**

(*Eng.* In this situation, "Eternal Sugimoto" was unkempt, with only one arm.)

K　Tidak mungkin aku bisa menghadapi Sugimoto Manusia Abadi sekarang. Tidak dengan tangan yang patah.

(*Eng.* There's no way I can face Immortal Human Sugimoto now. Not with a broken arm.)

(Appendix A, No. 342)

8. ST 大日本帝国陸軍　第七師団！　日露戦争では（りょじゅんこうりゃくせん）旅順攻略戦　奉天会戦という激戦地に送り込まれ大損害を出しつつも　勝利に貢献　道民は畏敬の念を含め「北鎮部隊」と呼ぶ

(*Eng.* The 7th division of the imperial Japanese army! During the Russo-Japanese war, it was sent to the fierce battlegrounds of the Battle of Port Arthur and the Battle of Mukden, and although it suffered heavy losses, it contributed to the victory. It's called the "Suppression Unit")

GT Bahagian Ke-7 Tentera Imperial Jepun! Dalam Perang Rusia-Jepun, mereka dihantar ke medan perang Pertempuran Port Arthur dan Pertempuran Mukden. Dipanggil Hokuchin Unit.

(*Eng.* The 7th Division of the Imperial Japanese Army! In the Russo-Japanese War, they were sent to the battlefields of the Battle of Port Arthur and the Battle of Mukden. Called Hokuchin Unit)

K Divisi 7 pasukan pemerintah Jepang! Di masa perang Rusia Jepang, mereka dikirim ke medan perang terparah, termasuk pengepungan pelabuhan Arthur　dan perang Mukden. Meski mengalami kekalahan, mereka adalah kontribusi utama kemenangan Jepang. Penduduk Hokkaido menyebut mereka, Unit Hokuchin.

(*Eng.* 7th Division of Japanese government troops! During the Russian-Japanese war, they were sent to the worst battlefields, including the siege of Port Arthur and the Mukden war. Even though they suffered defeat, they were the main contribution to Japan's victory. Hokkaido residents call them, the Hokuchin Unit.)

(Appendix A, No. 329)

exemplifies the varying degrees of equivalence applied by each method. *Komikcast* leans toward dynamic equivalence, ensuring that the meaning and emotional impact of the text are preserved while adapting it for the target audience. Whereas GT prioritises formal equivalence by striving to maintain structural and grammatical consistency, often at the expense of nuanced details and emotional context in the ST. This distinction emphasises that the choice of translation approach, whether formal or dynamic equivalence, can significantly influence the quality and effectiveness of the translated text, particularly in conveying subtle nuances and emotions. It underscores the critical role that the translator plays in making such decisions, as they must consider the purpose of the translation, the target audience's expectations, and the inherent meaning and style of the ST. This dynamic interplay between equivalence principles and translation strategies is essential for achieving successful and impactful translations (Xuejiao Quan & Wenjuan Yao, 2020).

Knowledge of the Translator

Given that most readers of 'Golden Kamuy' *manga* are young individuals, the translator must possess proficiency in employing a more mature and complex language style that maintains the same impact and clarity. The Japanese language commonly employs lengthy sentences, especially in dialogues, when conveying detailed messages. Therefore, the translator should be well-versed in the language used by young readers in their daily lives to ensure that the text resonates closely with them, thus capturing and retaining their attention. In example (8), *Komikcast* demonstrates greater fidelity in preserving the information intended by the ST compared to *GT*. Furthermore, GT has omitted certain information from the ST during translation, resulting in a lack of quality equivalence in the GT-translated text above. Despite both platforms succeeding in elucidating the theme of warfare, K*omikcast*'s output is more comprehensive and natural than GT. Such a theme is typically found in *manga*, targeted at more mature readers, as children's *manga* audiences may not be interested in or comprehend such themes.

Additionally, the skills of the translator also contribute to translation inequivalence. Translators must be adept at understanding the background of the ST to achieve maximum equivalence. Several major errors made by translators include a lack of comprehension of the ST, incompetence in producing appropriate grammar in the TT, and not using dictionaries or translation tools (Silalahi et al., 2018). Therefore, a translator's proficiency in comprehending the ST's context and background is crucial in achieving high equivalence in the TT.

9. ST ヒンナヒンナ．なんだい？ それ 食事に 感謝する言葉 私たちは食べながら言うんだ

(*Eng.* Hin-na-hin-na. What is that? It's a word we say while eating to express our gratitude for the meal.)

GT Hin-na-hin-na. Apa itu?Itu perkataan yang kita ucapkan semasa makan untuk menyatakan rasa terima kasih atas hidangan itu.

(*Eng.* Hin-na-hin-na. What is it? It's a word we say while eating to express our gratitude for the meal.)

K hinna, hinna! Kau bilang apa? Dalam bahasa Ainu, itu ucapan terima kasih atas makanan yang dihidangkan. Kami katakan sembari makan.

(*Eng.* hinna, hinna! What did you say? In the Ainu language, it is a thank you for the food served. We say while eating.)

(Appendix A, No. 374)

Cultural Differences

Additionally, producing a text that conveys meaning from the ST involves not only considering the differences between the ST and TT but also the cultural background disparities between the two languages. Translators must weigh cultural differences and bridge the cultural context of the ST with that of the TT as closely as possible to achieve maximum equivalence. In (9), both platforms retained and explained the Ainu language expression 'ヒンナヒンナ/ Hinna Hinna,' resulting in a successful message to the readers as intended by the ST.

In this regard, cultural-linguistic disparities play a role in translation inequivalence. Edward Sapir posited that "language is a guide to social reality," and language serves as a medium through which humans express their culture (Bassnett, 2014). Whorf concurred, explaining that without culture, language might not exist, and without language, a culture might not exist either. He likened language to the heart of cultural existence, and the interaction between these two aspects has given rise to enduring civilisations. Koentjaraningrat (1992) asserted that language is an integral part of culture, and the relationship between language and culture is subordinate.

Furthermore, Masinambow (1980) stated that language and culture are intertwined systems that define human identity. Numerous languages and cultures exist in this world, each with unique meanings. Understanding may not be sufficient but can be addressed by learning a foreign language, seeking a skilled translator, or finding translated materials in a language one understands. This explanation clarifies that translation inequivalence occurs due to vast cultural differences, resulting in a lack of lexical congruence, grammar, phrases, and expressions between the SL and TL. Furthermore, translation embodies the intricate process of transferring words, ideas, emotions, and cultural elements from one linguistic domain to another. Newmark (1981) underscores the artistic and intellectual facets of translation, emphasising its pivotal role in preserving semantic content and the stylistic nuances inherent in the ST. Similarly, while Nida and Taber (1969) contribute depth to this understanding by highlighting the paramount significance of attaining equivalence between the SL and TL both in meaning and style, Catford (1965) accentuates the importance of maintaining the original text's density during translation.

This multifaceted nature of translation, serving as a vital conduit for both linguistic and cultural exchange remains as essence for this study, which explores the practical application of these translation principles within the realm of *manga* translation. The dynamic interplay between human and machine translation methods is used to assess their implications for achieving textual equivalence. While advancements in machine translation might have led one to believe that human translators would become obsolete, the findings, *au contraire*, underscore the irreplaceable value of human translators especially for culturally rich content. This counters previous notions that machine translations, even sophisticated ones, can entirely replace the nuanced expertise of human translators. The study also sheds light on the challenges and nuances specific to Japanese-Malay/Indonesian translations, particularly within the realm of *manga* translation. It is crucial to understand cultural nuances to convey the intended message accurately, making cultural authenticity equally crucial while linguistic accuracy is paramount. Therefore, Japanese-Indonesian translations may require more than mere literal translation. This research contributes to the broader context of translation studies by highlighting the importance

of cultural authenticity in addition to linguistic accuracy. It also provides a practical exploration of the challenges involved in *manga* translation, serving as a testament to the significance of human expertise in this field especially in navigating the complex balance between language and culture.

IV. CONCLUSION

By far, this study has demonstrated that MT system particularly Google Translate (GT) and human translation, specifically *Komikcast*, do not employ all the translation strategies outlined by Vinay and Darbelnet (1958/95) but only Literal Translation, Borrowing, Equivalence, and Modulation. *GT* tends to favor Literal Translation, which allows for quick and basic accuracy in translating simple phrases. On the other hand, *Komikcast* leans towards the Equivalence strategy, which is more aligned with human proficiency and understanding of the context and nuances attached to the text. This results in the preservation of the meaning of the ST and natural expression

in the TT. In summary, *manga* translation is a complex and multifaceted process that requires a deep understanding of linguistic and cultural elements. The choice of translation strategy plays a significant role in the quality and effectiveness of the translation in conveying the intended meaning and emotions of the ST. It is crucial to recognize the strengths and limitations of both machine and human translation and acknowledge their respective roles in different contexts and for different purposes. As the field of comic translation continues to evolve, future research should explore the multifaceted nature of *manga* translation taking into consideration factors such as genre-specific nuances, visual culture, and the impact of different translation methods on reader engagement and comprehension. Additionally, further research could delve deeper into specific translation strategies employed by machines and humans in various domains and genres, providing more insights into the evolving landscape of translation practices in our increasingly interconnected world.

REFERENCES

Abdul Wahid, P. (2007). Komunikasi silang budaya dalam penterjemahan bahasa Melayu: analisis budaya kebendaan. *Jurnal Bahasa*, *7*(2), 111–113.

Abdul Wahid, P. R., Bukhari, N. A., & Minsung, C. (2019). Komunikasi Silang Budaya dan Penterjemahan: Analisis Teks Terjemahan Kreatif. *Jurnal Melayu Sedunia*, *2*(1), 1–36.

Akiko Hashimoto. (2023). *Pop Culture: Manga*. University of Pittsburg.

Amanda Pagan. (2018, December 27). *A Beginner's Guide to Manga*. New York Public Library. https://www.nypl.org/blog/2018/12/27/beginners-guide-manga#:~:text=Manga%20is%20an%20umbrella%20term,only%20used%20for%20special%20releases

Baker, M., & Baker, M. (1992). *In Other Words*. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203133590

Bassnett, S. (2014). *Translation Studies* (4th ed.). Routledge.

Berndt, J. (2014). Considering manga discourse: Location, ambiguity, historicity. In *Japanese Visual Culture* (pp. 295–310). Routledge.

Berndt, J. (2016). Manga, Which Manga? Publication Formats, Genres, Users. In Andrew Targowski, Juri Abe, & Hisanori Kato (Eds.), *Japanese Civilization in the 21st Century* (pp. 121–134). Nova Science Publishers, Inc.

Berndt, J. (2018). Anime in Academia: Representative Object, Media Form, and Japanese Studies. *Arts*, *7*(4), 56. https://doi.org/10.3390/arts7040056

Berndt, J. (2020). Manga as Japanese: Industry, Mediality, Representation. In Kurt Almqvist & Yukiko Duke Bergman (Eds.), *Japan's past and present* (pp. 115–125). Bokförlaget Stolpe.

Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. OUP.

Chan, L. T. H. (2017). Transgenderism in Japanese manga as radical translation: The Journey to the West Goes to Japan. In B. J. Baer & K. Kaindl (Eds.), *Queering Translation, Translating the Queer: Theory, Practice, Activism* (pp. 96–111). Routledge.

Chow, Y. F. (2023). A social semiotic multimodal analysis of ateji translation in manga. *Social Semiotics*,

33(4), 787–807. https://doi.org/10.1080/10350330.2021.1945417

Chow, Y. F., & Che Omar, H. (2019). The Translation of Giongo/Gitaigo in the Japanese Manga Kimi No Na Wa. *Jurnal Bahasa*, *19*(2), 307–328. https://doi.org/10.37052/jb.19(2)no6

Chow, Y. F., Che Omar, H., & Abdul Rahman, W. R. E. (2021). Manga Translation and Censorship Issues in Malaysia. *KEMANUSIAAN The Asian Journal of Humanities*, *28*(1), 1–21. https://doi.org/10.21315/kajh2021.28.1.1

Chow, Y. F., Haroon, H., & Omar, H. C. (2020). Reaching out to the readers: The translation of Japanese manga in Malaysia. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *10*(2), 538–550. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v10i2.28605

Chow, Y. F., & Omar, H. C. (2019). Factors Influencing Manga Translation in Malaysia. In Siti Wachidah, Dewi Rochsantiningsih, Dr. Rudi Hartono, & Dr. Mirjam Anugerahwati (Eds.), *ELTLT: English Language Teaching, Literature, and Translation*. Faculty of Language and Arts, Unnes.

Chow, Y. F., & Omar, H. C. (2021). Agency changes in manga translation. In A. Almanna & C. Gu (Eds.), *Translation as a Set of Frames* (pp. 32–48). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003024828

Darlington, T., & Cooper, S. (2010). The Power of Truth: Gender and Sexuality in Manga. In Toni Johnson-Woods (Ed.), *Manga: An Anthology of Global and Cultural Perspectives* (pp. 157–172).

Espresso Translations. (2023, July 4). Human Translation. *Espresso Translations*. https://www.espressotranslations.com/human-translation/

EVS: Global Translations and Business Services. (2012). *Comic translations – transferring humor across 20 languages*. EVS: Global Translations and Business Services.

Fabbretti, M. (2016). The Use of Translation Notes in Manga Scanlation. *TranscUlturAl: A Journal of Translation and Cultural Studies*, *8*(2), 86. https://doi.org/10.21992/T9SS57

Febri Nur Dwiyanti, . H., & Intan Suri. (2022). Penerjemahan Kanyouku dalam Novel Shikisai wo Motanai Tazaki Tsukuru to Kare no Junrei no Toshi Karya Haruki Murakami. *Humanis*, *26*(1), 56. https://doi.org/10.24843/JH.2022.v26.i01.p07

Freedman, A. (2018). Cultural literacy in the empire of emoji signs: Who is crying with joy? *First Monday*. https://doi.org/10.5210/fm.v23i9.9395

Freedman, A., & Slade, T. (2018). Introducing Japanese popular culture: Serious approaches to playful delights. In *Introducing Japanese popular culture* (pp. 1–10). Routledge.

Furuhata-turner, H. (2013). Use of Comics Manga as a Learning Tool to Teach Translation of Japanese. *The Journal of Language Learning and Teaching*, *3*(2), 72–83.

Hevia, C. M. (2007). Video Games Localisation: Posing New Challenges to the Translator. *Perspectives*, *14*(4), 306–323. https://doi.org/10.1080/09076760708669046

Hinami, R., Ishiwatari, S., Yasuda, K., & Matsui, Y. (2021). Towards Fully Automated Manga Translation. *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, 12998–13008. https://doi.org/10.1609/aaai.v35i14.17537

Ito, K. (2005). A history of manga in the context of Japanese culture and society. *Journal of Popular Culture*, *38*(3), 456.

Jaqueline, B., & Kümmerling-Meibauer, B. (2013). Introduction: Studying manga across cultures. In *Manga's Cultural Crossroads* (1st ed., pp. 1–15). Routledge.

Koentjaraningrat. (1992). *Kebudayaan Mentalitas dan Pembangunan*. Gramedia Pustaka Umum.

Lewicki, R. H. (2022). Prefiguring the Otokonoko Genre. *The Journal of Anime and Manga Studies*, *3*, 62–84. https://doi.org/10.21900/j.jams.v3.868

LompatLompat. (2020, October 1). *Golden Kamuy is read by men and women equally, data shows*. Kamuy Central. https://kamuycentral.wordpress.com/2020/10/01/golden-kamuy-equal-men-

women-readers/

MacWilliams, M. (2012). Religion and Manga. In *Handbook of Contemporary Japanese Religions* (pp. 595–628). BRILL. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004234369_026

Mahsun. (2012). *Metodologi Penelitian Bahasa: Tahapan Strategi, Metode, dan Tekniknya*. Rajagrafindo Persada.

Maser, V. (2020). Translated Yuri Manga in Germany. *Mechademia*, *13*(1), 159–162.

Masinambow, E. K. M. (1980). Struktur bahasa sebagai cermin pandangan hidup . In Ayatrohaedi, M. F. H. Swasono, & W. Soerjohardjo (Eds.), *Yang tersirat dan tersurat* (pp. 1–19). Fakultas Sastra Universitas Indonesia.

Mohd Ayob, N., & Mohamad, H. (2015). Perbandingan Terjemahan Manusia dan Terjemahan Mesin dalam Buku Fitness 24/7. *Jurnal Bahasa*, *15*(2), 307–335.

Muhammad Nur Ramadhan. (2019). *Penerjemahan Wakamono Kotoba Dalam Manga 'One Piece'*. Diponegoro University.

Newmark, P. (1981). *Approaches to Translation*. Prentice Hall International Ltd.

Nida, E. A. (1964). *Towards a Science of Translating: With Special Reference to Principles and Procedures Involved in Bible Translating*. Brill.

Nida, E. A., & Taber, C. R. (1969). *Nida, Eugene A (1969), The Theory and Practice of Translation*. E. J. Brill.

Ningsih, E., & Hidayat, R. S. (2018). Dynamic equivalence assessment of Japanese comic (manga) "garasu no kamen" into Indonesian language translation "topeng kaca"(the glass mask). *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Culture*, *4*(4), 53–68.

Nord, C. (2005). *Text Analysis in Translation: Theory, Methodology, and Didactic Application of a Model for Translation-oriented Text Analysis*. Rodopi.

Okyayuz, A. Ş. (2017). Examining the Translation and Scanlation of the Manga Naruto into Turkish from a Translator's Perspective. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies*, *5*(3), 161–173.

Prough, J. (2010a). Marketing Japan: Manga as Japan's New Ambassador. *ASIANetwork Exchange: A Journal for Asian Studies in the Liberal Arts*, *17*(2), 54. https://doi.org/10.16995/ane.207

Prough, J. (2010b). *Straight from the Heart: Gender, Intimacy, and the Cultural Production of Shojo Manga*. University of Hawaii Press.

Robin, E. B. (2007). *Understanding Manga and Anime*. Libraries Unlimited.

Rohan, O., Sasamoto, R., & O'Brien, S. (2021). Onomatopoeia: A relevance-based eye-tracking study of digital manga. *Journal of Pragmatics*, *186*, 60–72. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2021.09.018

Sajida Ayyup. (2020, July 25). SDCC '20: The Past, Present and Future of Manga Publishing. *The Beat: The Blog of Comics Culture*.

Salsabila, A., & Laksman-Huntley, M. (2020). Indonesian Translation of French Pronominal Verbs: Procedures and Shifts. *Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Language, Literature, and Arts Education (ICLLAE 2019)*. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200804.043

Sam Yip. (n.d.). *What is Neural Machine Translation & How does it work?* Translate FX. Retrieved 6 September 2023, from https://www.translatefx.com/blog/what-is-neural-machine-translation-engine-how-does-it-work?lang=en

Schodt, F. L. (2016). Translating Manga. *World Literature Today*, *90*(2), 7–7. https://doi.org/10.1353/wlt.2016.0055

Sell, C. (2011). Manga Translation and Interculture. *Mechademia*, *6*(1), 93–108. https://doi.org/10.1353/mec.2011.0002

Sharif, M. S., Romo, B. A., Maltby, H., & Al-Bayatti, A. (2021). An Effective Hybrid Approach Based on Machine Learning Techniques for Auto-Translation: Japanese to English. *2021 International Conference on Innovation and Intelligence for Informatics, Computing, and Technologies (3ICT)*, 557–562. https://doi.org/10.1109/3ICT53449.2021.9581629

Silalahi, M., Rafli, Z., & Rasyid, Y. (2018). The Analysis of Errors in Translation of Scientific Text from English to Indonesian Language. *JETL (Journal Of Education, Teaching and Learning)*, *3*(1), 23. https://doi.org/10.26737/jetl.v1i1.456

Takoboto. (2023). *Takoboto: Japanese dictionary & Nihongo study tool*. https://takoboto.jp

Tezuka Productions. (2023). *Tezuka Osamu Official*. Tezuka Productions. https://tezukaosamu.net/en/

Ting, G. E.-Y. (2019). Gender, manga, and anime. In *The Routledge Companion to Gender and Japanese Culture* (pp. 311–319). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315179582-31

Vahhabzadeh, K. (2018). Strategies of Censorship in Translating Children's Stories from English into Persian. *Iranian Journal of Translation Studies*, *15*(60).

Vinay, J. P., & Darbelnet, J. (1995). *Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A Methodology for Translation*. John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Wabbit Translations. (2022, January 31). Translating Comic Books: A very particular challenge . *Wabbit Translations*.

Wika Elfayanti. (2015). Strategi dan Prosedur Penerjemahan Idiom Bahasa Jepang Dalam Komik Doraemon Teema Betsu Kessaku Sen Edisi 1-17. *Humanis: Journal of Arts and Humanities*, *11*(3), 1–7.

Williams, M. Mac. (2009). Imaging Japanese Religion in the Classroom: Mandala, Manga, Pizza, and Gardens. *ASIANetwork Exchange: A Journal for Asian Studies in the Liberal Arts*, *16*(2), 86. https://doi.org/10.16995/ane.226

Xuejiao Quan, & Wenjuan Yao. (2020). A Study of the Effects of Equivalence Theory and Equivalent Effect on Translators' Choices----With an Illustration of Chinese Translation of Charlotte's Web. *International Journal of New Developments in Engineering and Society*, *4*(1), 93–100.

Yang, Y. (2021). *Danmaku* subtitling: An exploratory study of a new grassroots translation practice on Chinese video-sharing websites. *Translation Studies*, *14*(1), 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1080/14781700.2019.1664318

Yogyanti, D. (2022). Implikasi Diatesis pada Struktur Sintaksis Bahasa Jepang. *JISIP (Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Pendidikan)*, *6*(3). https://doi.org/10.58258/jisip.v6i3.3434

Yuniarsih Yuniarsih, Eky Kusuma Hapsari, & Andra Roni Kusuma. (2022). Transposition and Modulation occured in the Translation of Meitantei Conan Manga Volume 61. *Jurnal Kata*, *6*(1), 13–24. https://doi.org/10.22216/kata.v6i1.551

Zanettin, F. (2008). *Comics in Translation* (Federico Zanettin, Ed.; 1st ed.). Routledge.

Zanettin, F. (2014). Visual adaptation in translated comics. *Intralinea*, *16*, 1–34.

Zanettin, F. (2018). Manga in America. Transnational book publishing and the domestication of Japanese comics. *The Translator*, *24*(3), 279–283. https://doi.org/10.1080/13556509.2017.1352124

Zanettin, F. (2019). Comics, manga and graphic novels. In *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (pp. 75–79). Routledge.